a) 3/08/1944/FP – Amendment to LPA reference 3/08/1133/FP involving alterations to the previously approved extensions and alterations; and b) 3/08/1945/LB – Amendment to LPA reference 3/08/11134/LB involving alterations to the previously approved extensions at 17 Church End, Braughing for Mrs R Cheswright

Date of Receipt: 14.11.2008 **Type:** Full

Parish: BRAUGHING

Ward: BRAUGHING

RECOMMENDATION

- a) That in respect of application 3/08/1944/FP planning permission be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:-
 - 1. Three Year Time Limit (1T12)
 - 2. Samples of materials (2E12)

Directives

- 1. Other Legislation (01OL1)
- 2. The development hereby approved should proceed with caution, particularly demolition works. If the presence of bats is found work should stop immediately and Natural England contacted on 01206 796666

Summary of Reasons for Decision

The proposal has been considered with regard to the policies of the Development Plan (East of England Plan May 2008 and East Herts Local Plan Second Review 2007), and in particular polices ENV1, ENV2, ENV5, ENV6, BH1, BH4, BH6, BH12 and OSV1. The balance of the considerations having regard to those policies is that permission should be granted.

- b) That in respect of application 3/08/1945/LB listed building consent be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:-
 - 1. Listed Building Three Year Time Limit (1T141)
 - 2. Samples of materials (2E12)
 - 3. Listed Building (New Windows) (8L033)
 - 4. Listed Building (New Doors) (8L043)

- 5. Listed Building (New External Rendering) (8L083)
- 6. Listed Building (New Rainwater Goods) (8L093)
- 7. Listed Building (Making Good) (8L103)

Summary of Reasons for Decision for grant only

The proposal has been considered with regard to the policies of the Development Plan (East of England Plan May 2008 and East Herts Local Plan Second Review 2007), and in particular policy BH10. The balance of the considerations having regard to those policies is that permission should be granted.

1.0 Background

- 1.1 Members may recall that planning permission and listed building consent were granted within LPA references 3/08/1944/FP and 3/08/1945/LB at the 27 August Committee Meeting, for similar proposals at the same site. Amendments to the scheme have been proposed which, owing to their increase in size and scale and number of alterations cannot be considered as 'minor amendments', thus the proposals are being reported to this Development Control Meeting. A copy of the previous committee report is attached as appendix A. In addition, this application has been submitted by a Member of the Council.
- 1.2 The site is located within the settlement of Braughing, on the western side of Church Lane. The site is bounded to the north and south by residential properties. Many of the properties along Church Lane are listed and the site lies within the Braughing Conservation Area. To the east of Church End is the boundary to St Mary's Church and graveyard. The application site is shown on the attached OS extract.
- 1.3 The dwelling known as 17 Church End is a grade II Listed Building. The grounds of the plot are significant with a number of mature trees and landscape features, which leads down a relatively steep slope to the bank of the River Quin. To the side of the property is an outbuilding of a timber structure which is adjoined to a glass house and patio section which runs flush to the boundary with 18 Church End.
- 1.4 The proposed amendments to the previously approved scheme includes the following:-

Front Façade

- Alteration to the fenestration configuration on the front gable
- Removal of the previously approved bay window and replacement with single window
- Alteration to size and siting of dormer windows
- Insertion of down pipes

Rear Façade

- Increase in width of two storey rear gable element by approximately 200mm
- Alteration to fenestration configuration on single storey 'lean to' element
- Alteration to size of dormer windows on rear roof slope
- Removal of existing chimney

2.0 Site History

- 2.1 The only planning history of which is relevant to the site (excluding previous approvals under LPA references 3/08/1133/FP and 3/08/1134/LB) includes the following:-
 - E/029-53 Conversion of two cottages to one dwellinghouse (Approved)
 E/766-54 Alterations to cottage (Approved)
 E/406-72 2 storey extension to north side (Approved with conditions)

3.0 <u>Consultation Responses</u>

- 3.1 Herts Biological Records Centre have commented that as the application is for predominantly new extensions with small sections of the existing dwelling to be demolished, those specific parts of the house may not be used by bats as a roost site, but the proposed works may cause disturbance to the bats. Should the LPA be minded to grant permission an advisory note is recommended stating that the development should proceed with caution and, if evidence of bats is found then work must be stopped immediately and Natural England informed.
- 3.2 English Heritage have commented that the applications should be determined in accordance with national and local policy guidance and on the basis of specialist conservation advice.

4.0 Parish Council Representations

4.1 At the time of writing this report no response has been received from the Parish Council.

5.0 Other Representations

5.1 The applications have been advertised by way of press notice, site notice and neighbour notification. At the time of writing this report no responses has been received.

6.0 Policy

- 6.1 The relevant policies of the East Herts Local Plan April 2007 include:-
 - ENV1 Design and Environmental Quality
 - ENV2 Landscaping
 - ENV5 Extensions to Dwellings
 - ENV6 Extensions to Dwellings Criteria
 - ENV11 Protection of Existing Hedgerows and Trees
 - BH1 Archaeology and New Development
 - BH4 Demolition in Conservation Area
 - BH6 New Development in Conservation Areas
 - BH10 Extensions and Alterations to Listed Buildings
 - BH12 Development Affecting the Setting of a Listed Building
 - OSV1 Category 1 Villages

7.0 Considerations

- 7.1 The previous approvals Members granted as mentioned above, accepted the principle of the development and detailed design matters. The only considerations within these applications are whether the revised scheme is equally acceptable in terms of the design and impact on the character and appearance of the listed building and the Braughing Conservation Area.
- 7.2 Turning therefore to the details outlined in paragraph 1.4, the front façade. With respect to the dormer window, taking into account the limited increase in size and re-siting of this element, I am of the opinion that the dormer windows do not dominate the roof slope. The alterations to the fenestration also, in particular the removal of the bay window are, in my view changes which would improve the simplicity of the frontage. Cumulatively therefore it is considered that the alterations to the front façade would be in keeping with the appearance of the listed building

- 7.3 With regards to the rear façade, the most significant amendment revolves around the increase in the size and scale of the two storey rear gable. However, despite the increase, the extension appears subservient to the main bulk of the dwelling. The other alterations to the fenestration and dormers are also considered to be in keeping with the character and appearance of the listed building.
- 7.4 The removal of the chimney is considered to be a more significant change. However, taking into account that this element is not visible from the street frontage, and that there are existing chimneys proposed to be retained, the change is not considered to be unduly harmful to the character and appearance of the dwellinghouse or Conservation Area.

8.0 Conclusion

8.1 Taking into account all the above, it is considered that the proposed extensions and alterations are acceptable in terms of their impact on the historic nature of the property and with regard to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.